

# **A Central Asian Perspective of Security in Afghanistan**

**By Matthew Stein**

The views expressed are those of the author and do not represent the official policy or position of the Department of the Army, Department of Defense, or the U.S. government.

## **A Central Asian Perspective of Security in Afghanistan**

In the ten years since the start of Operation Enduring Freedom (OEF) the five Central Asian countries (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan) contributed support for International Security Assistance Force (ISAF) operations by granting overflight rights and use of airfields for transit or search and rescue operations, and allowing overland logistics of non-lethal supplies.<sup>1</sup> The drawdown of forces in 2014 from Afghanistan will affect the conduct of regional affairs and regional security, particularly for the countries of Central Asia. However, Central Asian perspectives of the future of Afghanistan are often overlooked. There are a number of articles by security analysts and academics in Central Asia that offer detailed and candid perspectives of ISAF operations and security in Afghanistan, though these may not be noticed or well received by policy-makers in the United States. A brief examination of articles by one such author, Dr. Viktor Dubovitsky, can help better understand the Central Asian perspective of security in Afghanistan. It is also worth comparing Dubovitsky's thoughts with an official perspective.

Dr. Dubovitsky is the Deputy Director of the Institute of History of the Academy of Sciences of Tajikistan and has written several articles that present a Central Asian perspective of operations in Afghanistan and the withdrawal of combat forces from there in 2014. A quick review of several of Dubovitsky's articles (from July 2010 to June 2012) indicates that there are four main points. First, Dubovitsky considers that U.S. and coalition efforts to provide security in Afghanistan have failed.<sup>2</sup> Second, he believes that the Afghan National Army (ANA) will not be ready to take over its responsibilities for security by 2014.<sup>3</sup> Third, he foresees that the planned withdrawal will destabilize the Central Asia region, resulting in increasing demands for

regional security organizations like the Collective Security Treaty Organization (CSTO) and the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO). Dubovitsky believes that these organizations may need to intervene in Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, or Uzbekistan in the event of a conflict.<sup>4</sup> Finally, he sees the withdrawal of coalition forces leading to a civil war between Pashtuns and the other ethnic groups of Afghanistan, including Tajiks, Hazaras, and Uzbeks, and he sees them creating a new version of the Northern Alliance.<sup>5</sup>

Since Dubovitsky has a negative view of the overall situation and future of Afghanistan, Western audiences may quickly dismiss him; nevertheless, these are significant articles. Before examining the significance of Dubovitsky's perspective, it is worth taking a brief look at the Central Asian governments' involvement with Afghanistan before 2001. This provides context to his perspective; however, his is only one viewpoint. For example, Kamoludin Abdullaev, also a professor from Tajikistan, believes that threats to Central Asian security will not come from Afghanistan, but rather from circumstances within each of the countries.<sup>6</sup>

#### *Central Asia's Involvement with Afghanistan: 1991-2001*

The governments of Central Asia not only had an obvious concern for what was happening during the Afghan Civil War in the 1990s, but also had some involvement in it. Tajikistan and India established a small hospital at Tajikistan's Farkhor airfield (just across the border from the Takhar Province, Afghanistan). The hospital attended to wounded members of the Northern Alliance. When prominent commander Ahmad Shah Massoud (an ethnic Tajik) was mortally wounded by an assassin on September 8, 2001, he was flown to Farkhor for treatment, but died en route.<sup>7</sup> Besides the hospital, the Northern Alliance maintained an embassy in Dushanbe, Tajikistan up until and during the early stages of OEF.<sup>8</sup>

In addition to Tajikistan, the government of Uzbekistan gave various levels of support to the Northern Alliance, particularly to ethnic Uzbek leader Rashid Dostum, although this support has not been consistent from the 1990s through the present. The government of Uzbekistan has also supported Atta Mohammed Nur, the ethnic Tajik governor of the northern Balkh Province and former commander in the Northern Alliance. Most visibly, Governor Nur received medical treatment in Uzbekistan in 2009.<sup>9</sup>

Before 2001 the governments of Central Asia did not limit their involvement in Afghanistan by supporting one Northern Alliance leader or another. In 1997 Uzbek President Islam Karimov proposed a group called Six plus Two to the UN Secretary General's Special Envoy on Afghanistan, Lakhdar Brahimi. Six plus Two included all the countries bordering Afghanistan (China, Iran, Pakistan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan) plus the two other countries with an interest in security in Afghanistan (the United States and Russia). The goal of Six plus Two was to create a dialogue between the member nations and all factions in Afghanistan, ultimately so that the conflict would be resolved through negotiation and not military means.<sup>10</sup>

The UN Security Council backed the declaration, particularly its goals of not providing weapons or military support to any group in Afghanistan. The organization held a few meetings to discuss ending the conflict and eliminating drug trafficking and production originating in Afghanistan.<sup>11</sup> Six plus Two effectively stopped meeting following the September 11, 2001 attacks on the United States. President Karimov tried to revitalize the group during the 2008 NATO Summit in Bucharest.<sup>12</sup> The group would have been called Six plus Three, to include of all the previous members with the addition of NATO. However, Six plus Three did not receive much support and has remained only a proposal.<sup>13</sup>

### *A Comparison of Dubovitsky's and an Official Perspective*

The governments of Central Asia are not likely to make public statements as blunt as Dubovitsky's assessment, but they have expressed concern about security issues stemming from the 2014 drawdown in Afghanistan.<sup>14</sup> However, there is one example that reveals the government perspective just as much as any official statements.

On May 18, 2011 Kazakhstan's Majilis (the lower house of parliament) approved a bill to send four soldiers to the ISAF headquarters in Kabul, Afghanistan. The bill came from an earlier agreement with NATO, stipulating that the soldiers would serve in non-combat positions for a period of several months on a rotating basis.<sup>15</sup> On June 9, 2011 Kazakhstan's Senate (the upper house of parliament) refused to ratify the bill on the deployment. The bill has not been revived.<sup>16</sup>

At the time of the Senate's refusal, there was speculation that the government had capitulated to a threat from the Taliban. On May 22, 2011 the Taliban issued a statement to Kazakhstan that warned sending troops to Afghanistan would have consequences.<sup>17</sup> The statement came soon after a suicide bomber attacked the provincial National Security Committee (KNB) headquarters in the city of Aktobe and a car bomb exploded outside a KNB detention facility in Astana, Kazakhstan.<sup>18</sup> However, there was no connection between the bombings and the Taliban and, moreover, veterans groups (of the Soviet war in Afghanistan) and the general public expressed strong opposition to the bill.<sup>19</sup>

The decision not to support the deployment of soldiers to Afghanistan is significant when considering the level of security cooperation between the United States and Kazakhstan. Kazakhstan has had the most involvement in security cooperation with the United States among

the Central Asian countries. This involvement includes U.S. assistance with the removal of Kazakhstan's nuclear weapons that the country had inherited with the collapse of the Soviet Union, Kazakhstan's participation with the Arizona National Guard in the U.S. National Guard State Partnership Program since the mid-1990s, Kazakhstan's participation in the Central Asian Peacekeeping Battalion (CENTRASBAT) in the late 1990s, and the development of the Kazakhstan Peacekeeping Brigade (KAZBRIG) to achieve interoperability with NATO forces for potential peacekeeping missions.<sup>20</sup> Kazakhstan has also participated in a number of joint exercises with the United States that dealt with disaster response, command and control, various tactics, and peacekeeping. The exercises include:

- Joint Combined Training Exercises (JCET) exercises: “Balance Kayak (1996-1999),” “Balance Bars (2002),” and “Balance Zhardem (1999, 2002, and 2005),”<sup>21</sup>
- Cooperative Osprey exercises in 1996, 1998, and 2001<sup>22</sup>
- Cooperative Nugget exercises in 1997 and 2000<sup>23</sup>
- Combined Endeavor exercises in 1998-2004 and 2009-2011<sup>24</sup>
- International Workshop for Emergency Response (IWER) exercises in 1999-2001<sup>25</sup>
- Regional Cooperation Exercises in 2001 and 2004-2012<sup>26</sup>
- Steppe Eagle exercises in 2003-2012;<sup>27</sup> an exercise is planned for August 2013<sup>28</sup>
- Euro-Atlantic Disaster Response Coordination Centre (EADRCC) exercises: “Fergana-2003,” “Zhetysu-2009,” “CODRII-2011,” and “Georgia-2012”<sup>29</sup>
- RESCUER/MEDCUER exercise in 2005<sup>30</sup>

Additionally, a group from KAZBRIG (then called the Kazakhstan Peacekeeping Battalion, KAZBBAT) deployed to Iraq from 2003-08 and sustained one casualty in 2005.<sup>31</sup>

Despite Kazakhstan's active participation in security cooperation with the United States, which does indicate some common strategic goals, the government of Kazakhstan did not consider the deployment of four soldiers to ISAF to be in its best interests, although Kazakhstan will continue supporting stability in Afghanistan in other ways.<sup>32</sup> While this is not a specific or blunt assessment of operations and the development of the ANA in Afghanistan, it does provide insight into one official perspective alongside Dubovitsky's on these two issues.

One of the other points that Dubovitsky asserts is that the CSTO and the SCO will have increasing demands placed on them in 2014 and that the organizations may need to intervene in Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, or Uzbekistan in the event of a conflict spreading from Afghanistan. Both organizations have expressed concern about what will happen in Afghanistan in 2014.<sup>33</sup> In addition, the CSTO granted observer status to Afghanistan in April 2013.<sup>34</sup> In the last several years both organizations conducted numerous joint military exercises that trained for scenarios of responding to a conflict similar to what they believe could emerge from Afghanistan. The exercises include:

- Commonwealth Southern Shield exercises 1999-2002<sup>35</sup>
- Rubezh (Frontier) exercises in 2004-2007, and 2010;<sup>36</sup> Rubezh exercises also took place in 2008 and 2012, but focused on incidents in Russia and Armenia respectively
- Tsentr exercises in 2008, 2011<sup>37</sup>
- Interaction-2009;<sup>38</sup> Interaction exercises also took place in 2010 and 2012, but like Rubezh, focused on incidents in Russia and Armenia respectively

- Cobalt-2010<sup>39</sup>
- Enduring Brotherhood-2012<sup>40</sup>

SCO exercises include:

- Exercise-01 (in 2001)<sup>41</sup>
- Coalition-2003 (also referred to as Cooperation-2003)<sup>42</sup>
- Peace Mission exercises in 2005, 2007, 2009, 2010, and 2012<sup>43</sup>
- Tianshan I (2006) and Tianshan II (2011)<sup>44</sup>
- Vostok (East) Antiterror 2006<sup>45</sup>
- Issyk-Kul Antiterror 2007<sup>46</sup>
- Volgograd Antiterror 2008<sup>47</sup>
- Norak Antiterror 2009<sup>48</sup>

While the lists of exercises show that both organizations have been preparing for possible threats, Dubovitsky does not clarify what he means by saying the organizations may need to intervene. He could be referring to a peacekeeping force or at least some form of security assistance in response to a conflict. An intervention by a peacekeeping force in any one of these three countries by either the CSTO or SCO would be complicated, perhaps unfeasible. A fundamental issue that cannot be overlooked when considering an intervention by either or both organizations is the facts that Turkmenistan is not a member of either organization and Uzbekistan is only a member of the SCO.<sup>49</sup>

The CSTO's main agreements state that the organization does not interfere in the domestic affairs of its member states, much less that of other states, although there are exceptions to this. The agreements outline situations when the organization could intervene, but this only applies to member states and relates to situations when the security of a member of the

organization is threatened by an external force. The CSTO could deploy to a member state in response to an internal conflict, but only at the request of that government and with a majority support of other member states; this is a relatively recent change after it received criticism for not responding to the June 2010 violence in southern Kyrgyzstan, but at that time the CSTO could not have because of its charter.<sup>50</sup> The organization's agreements allow for a peacekeeping force to deploy in response to a conflict outside of a member state, but only with the backing of the UN.<sup>51</sup> However, the CSTO has not indicated that it would provide peacekeepers for a conflict in a non-member state, and specifically excluded intervention in Afghanistan after 2014.<sup>52</sup>

The SCO's charter is similar to the CSTO's in that the organization's principles state that it does not interfere in the internal affairs of other states. The SCO's security focus is to combat terrorism, separatism, and extremism.<sup>53</sup> It has taken steps to work with Afghanistan on security issues; it set up a contact group with Afghanistan in 2005 and gave the country status as an observer in the organization in 2012.<sup>54</sup> The SCO does not have any framework to intervene in the event of a conflict in a member or non-member state, but, through the organization's Regional Anti-Terrorism Structure (RATS), member states share intelligence and coordinate policy on dealing with threats.<sup>55</sup>

Dubovitsky's belief that the CSTO and SCO will have increasing demands placed on them does have merit when compared to how the organizations perceive the main threats to security in the region. Both organizations have been preparing for the 2014 drawdown of ISAF forces from Afghanistan. However, Dubovitsky's belief that both may need to intervene in the event of a conflict is not in line with what the organizations are able to do according to their charters and main agreements. The CSTO could intervene in Tajikistan, but only after a request from that government and approval from a majority of CSTO members. The CSTO could

intervene in Turkmenistan or Uzbekistan, but only if it were tasked to do so by the UN. Additionally, the CSTO has shown that it is not interested in deploying peacekeepers to Afghanistan, making it unlikely that the organization would get involved in a conflict outside the zone of its members. Outside of the CSTO, the Russian government has considered deploying its border forces to Tajikistan; this was mentioned in May 2011 and again in May 2013.<sup>56</sup> Russian border forces were deployed in Tajikistan on the Tajik-Afghan border following the collapse of the Soviet Union through the Tajik Civil War (1992-97) until 2005.<sup>57</sup> However, a redeployment of Russian border forces has not received consideration in Tajikistan.

In accordance with its current charter, the SCO, quite simply, would not intervene in a conflict in any of the three countries. The organization would very likely offer support through the RATS, but this would not include Turkmenistan. Individually, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan have stated concerns about security in Afghanistan and what might happen with the 2014 drawdown of forces.<sup>58</sup> In any case, support through the RATS may not be the level of intervention that Dubovitsky sees as necessary.

The last point that Dubovitsky raises is that the drawdown in 2014 will lead to a civil war in Afghanistan and that non-Pashtun ethnic groups will form a new Northern Alliance. This is a much more complicated point to compare to an official perspective. Based on these governments' past involvement with Afghanistan, there is no question they would have concerns about a civil war along their southern border. President of Kazakhstan Nursultan Nazarbayev has stated that he does not believe in negative predictions regarding Central Asian security in 2014.<sup>59</sup> This was repeated by Kazakhstan's first deputy minister of defense.<sup>60</sup> As previously mentioned, the governments of Central Asia have expressed concerns about the 2014 drawdown, but they have not specifically predicted a civil war in Afghanistan or the formation of a new

Northern Alliance. These governments continue to support Hamid Karzai and the current government of Afghanistan, and voicing this kind of prediction would likely undermine Karzai's government.<sup>61</sup>

It is worth examining events that may have influenced Dubovitsky. In 2011 and 2012 Mohammed Daud Daud, Burhanuddin Rabbani, and Ahmad Khan Samangani were assassinated; all had been involved in the Northern Alliance.<sup>62</sup> These were among a number of assassinations of well known Afghan figures across the country over the last several years, although not all those killed were a part of the Northern Alliance.<sup>63</sup> Additionally, in November 2011 some of the leaders of the political parties that made up the Northern Alliance formed a coalition, the Coalition of Afghanistan National Front.<sup>64</sup>

Dubovitsky cites the assassinations of Daud Daud and Rabbani as proof of a future civil war.<sup>65</sup> He does not, however, mention the National Front coalition, even in his two articles written after November 2011.<sup>66</sup>

The value of looking at an official (Central Asian governments' or security organizations') perspective on the same issues that Dubovitsky wrote about is that this makes it possible to see some parallels between the two. The governments of Central Asia have not made any statements as blunt as Dubovitsky about security in Afghanistan or the capabilities of the ANA, although they have concerns about the overall situation. Kazakhstan's decision not to deploy four soldiers to ISAF headquarters does not definitively demonstrate a Central Asian perspective, as it does not include the other four governments. However, considering the level of security cooperation between the United States and Kazakhstan, particularly the development of KAZBRIG for the purpose of achieving interoperability with NATO peacekeeping forces, the

government's decision was notable. It shows that at least one official perspective on these two issues is not far off from Dubovitsky's.

The CSTO's and SCO's perspectives on Afghanistan are also similar to Dubovitsky's; this comes from official statements and the numerous joint exercises that each organization conducted. Dubovitsky's view that these organizations will need to intervene in Central Asia does not match with what either is currently able to do according their charters and main agreements. While it is possible for the CSTO to intervene, the organization's requirements for an intervention make it unlikely.

Lastly, Dubovitsky's belief that the 2014 drawdown will cause a civil war in Afghanistan and the formation of a new Northern Alliance is too difficult to compare to an official perspective. Instead of making a comparison between Dubovitsky's and an official perspective, it is worth considering that if Dubovitsky's prediction of a civil war were to come true, the countries of Central Asia could be facing a similar set of circumstances that they did from 1991-2001. Based on Central Asian governments' involvement with Afghanistan during this time period, a civil war would cause a lot of concern and is likely something that they have taken into account.

The overall significance of Dubovitsky's perspective is that it does agree with some official perspectives. Unlike government officials in Central Asia, Dubovitsky is able to voice his viewpoint without having to be diplomatic. The similarities do not mean that Dubovitsky is representative of an official stance, but that consideration should be given to what he has written.

## Notes

---

<sup>1</sup> U.S. Air Force, Transit Center at Manas, <http://www.manas.afcent.af.mil/index.asp>, (accessed March 25, 2013); U.S. Air Force, "Ganci AB Supports Flood of Soldiers," August 7, 2003, <http://www.af.mil/news/story.asp?storyID=123005381>, (accessed March 25, 2013); "Kyrgyzstan Orders U.S. to

---

Close Air Base,” *RFE/RL*, February 3, 2009, [http://www.rferl.org/content/Kyrgyzstan\\_Orders\\_US\\_To\\_Close\\_Air\\_Base/1378738.html](http://www.rferl.org/content/Kyrgyzstan_Orders_US_To_Close_Air_Base/1378738.html), (accessed March 25, 2013); “Kyrgyz Parliament Approves U.S. Manas Base Deal,” *RIA Novosti*, June 24, 2009, <http://en.rian.ru/world/20090624/155339689.html>, (accessed March 25, 2013); U.S. Department of Defense, Office of the Assistant Secretary of Defense (Public Affairs), News Transcript, “Secretary Rumsfeld Press Conference with President of Uzbekistan,” October 8, 2001, <http://www.defense.gov/Transcripts/Transcript.aspx?TranscriptID=2020>, (accessed March 25, 2013); Ron Synovitz, “Uzbekistan: U.S. Confirms End of Air Base Agreement With Tashkent,” *RFE/RL*, July 31, 2005, <http://www.rferl.org/content/article/1060306.html>, (accessed March 25, 2013); “Ceremony to Close U.S. Military Base Held in Uzbekistan,” *RIA Novosti*, November 21, 2005, <http://en.rian.ru/world/20051121/42166025.html>, (accessed March 25, 2013); Sofia Rothwell, “NATO, Uzbekistan and the ISAF Withdrawal,” *ISN Security Watch*, March 21, 2013, <http://www.isn.ethz.ch/isn/Digital-Library/Articles/Detail/?id=161997>, (accessed March 25, 2013).

<sup>2</sup> Viktor Dubovitsky, “Afganskiĭ rimeĭk,” *Afghanistan.ru*, July 29, 2010, <http://www.afghanistan.ru/doc/17985.html>, (accessed May 2, 2013).

<sup>3</sup> Viktor Dubovitsky, “Sokrushitel’nyĭ udar po «Nesokrushimoĭ svobode»,” *Peacekeeper.ru*, June 25, 2012, <http://peacekeeper.ru/ru/?module=news&action=view&id=15198>, (accessed May 2, 2012).

<sup>4</sup> “Viktor Dubovitsky: «vyvod voĭsk SSHA i ikh soyuznikov iz afganistana sushchestvenno izmenit situatsiyu v tsentral’noĭ azii»,” *Politikom*, December 8, 2010, <http://www.politcom.ru/article.php?id=11146>, (accessed May 2, 2013); Viktor Dubovitsky, “Ocherednoĭ iskhod evropeitsev iz Afganistana i vektory afganskogo Vozrozhdeniya,” *Asia-Plus*, October 7, 2011, <http://www.asia-plus.tj/en/node/110359>, (accessed May 2, 2013).

<sup>5</sup> Dubovitsky, “Afganskiĭ rimeĭk,”; Viktor Dubovitsky, “Amerikanskiĭ Plan “B”: raschlenenie Afganistana,” *Peacekeeper.ru*, March 23, 2011, <http://www.peacekeeper.ru/ru/?module=news&action=view&id=12443>, (accessed May 2, 2013); Viktor Dubovitsky, “«Nesokrushimaya svoboda» mozhet prinesti afgantsam grazhdanskuyu voĭnu,” *Peacekeeper.ru*, May 30, 2011, <http://peacekeeper.ru/ru/?module=news&action=view&id=12789>, (accessed May 2, 2013); Viktor Dubovitsky, “Afganistan: kto vydaet litsenzii na ostrel,” *Peacekeeper.ru*, February 2, 2012, <http://peacekeeper.ru/ru/?module=news&action=view&id=14094>, (accessed May 2, 2013).

<sup>6</sup> “Kamoluddin Abdullaev: Tret’ya grazhdanskaya voĭna v Tadzhiĭskane mozhet doĭti do ulits Moskvyy,” *Regnum Belarus*, February 20, 2013, <http://www.belarus.regnum.ru/news/1627266.html>, (accessed March 27, 2013).

<sup>7</sup> Coll, Steve. *Ghost Wars*, New York: The Penguin Press, 2004; Sudha Ramachandran, “India’s Foray Into Central Asia,” *Asia Times*, August 12, 2006, [http://www.atimes.com/atimes/South\\_Asia/HH12Df01.html](http://www.atimes.com/atimes/South_Asia/HH12Df01.html), (accessed November 28, 2012).

<sup>8</sup> Viktoria Panfilova and Nataliya Pulina, “Sud’ba Masuda neyasna,” *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, September 12, 2001, [http://www.ng.ru/politics/2001-09-12/1\\_masud.html](http://www.ng.ru/politics/2001-09-12/1_masud.html), (accessed November 28, 2012).

<sup>9</sup> Bernardo Teles Fazendeiro, “Uzbekistan’s Afghan Interests and Its Foreign Policy after 2014: A turning point for opening Central Asia?,” Defence Academy of the United Kingdom, *Central Asia Series* 12, no. 3 (2012), <http://www.da.mod.uk/publications/library/central-asian-series/20120710-cas-12-03-U.pdf/view>, (accessed

---

November 29, 2012); Dmitrii Alyaev, Fyodor Burzaliev, and Gulya Chernogayeva, "Otnosheniya Uzbekistana s zarubezh'em," *Kommersant*, June 23, 1995.

<sup>10</sup> See: UN Security Council Press Release, <http://www.un.org/News/Press/docs/1999/19991022.sc6743.doc.html>, (accessed March 26, 2013).

<sup>11</sup> See: UN Information Service, <http://www.unis.unvienna.org/unis/pressrels/2000/sg2511.html>, (accessed March 26, 2013); and <http://www.unis.unvienna.org/unis/pressrels/2000/sg2666.html>, (accessed March 26, 2013).

<sup>12</sup> *Jahon*, Information Agency of the MFA of Uzbekistan, "Address by President of the Republic of Uzbekistan H.E. Mr. Islam Karimov at the NATO/EPAC Summit, Bucharest, April 3, 2008, [http://web.archive.org/web/20100728233939/http://www.jahonnews.uz/eng/president/addresses\\_speeches/address\\_by\\_president\\_of\\_the\\_republic\\_of\\_uzbekistan\\_islam\\_karimov.mgr](http://web.archive.org/web/20100728233939/http://www.jahonnews.uz/eng/president/addresses_speeches/address_by_president_of_the_republic_of_uzbekistan_islam_karimov.mgr), (accessed with the Way Back Machine, March 26, 2013).

<sup>13</sup> "Verkhushka talibov ne mozhet byt' proshchena," *Vremya Novostei*, November 17, 2008, <http://www.vremya.ru/2008/212/5/217155.html>, (accessed March 26, 2013).

<sup>14</sup> "Odnou iz samykh aktual'nykh zadach SVMDA yavlyatsya realizatsiya mer, napravlennykh na reshenie problem Afganistana – N. Nazarbayev," *Kazinform*, September 12, 2012, <http://www.inform.kz/rus/article/2493860>, (accessed May 1, 2013); "Tokon Mamytov: Afganistan mozhet stat' ugrozoi dlya vseh stran-uchastnits ODKB," *Vechernii Bishkek*, September 18, 2012, [http://www.vb.kg/doc/199920\\_tokon\\_mamytov:\\_afganistan\\_mojet\\_stat\\_vgrozoy\\_dlia\\_vseh\\_stran\\_ychastnic\\_odk\\_b.html](http://www.vb.kg/doc/199920_tokon_mamytov:_afganistan_mojet_stat_vgrozoy_dlia_vseh_stran_ychastnic_odk_b.html), (accessed May 1, 2013); "Emomali Rakhmon obespokoen bezopasnost'yu Tadjikistana posle ukhoda sil NATO iz Afganistana," *Trend*, April 20, 2012, <http://www.trend.az/regions/casia/tajikistan/2017015.html>, (accessed May 1, 2013); "Prezident Uzbekistana schitaet neobkhodimym sozdaniye gruppy dialoga po Afganistanu," *Trend*, December 8, 2012, <http://www.trend.az/regions/casia/uzbekistan/2096959.html>, (accessed May 1, 2013).

<sup>15</sup> Muratbek Makulbekov, "Kazakhstan napravit chetyrekh ofitserov v sostav Mezhdurodnykh sil sodeystviya bezopasnosti v Afganistane," *Kazinform*, May 18, 2011, <http://www.inform.kz/rus/article/2380929>, (accessed April 18, 2013).

<sup>16</sup> Muratbek Makulbekov, "SROCHNO: Senat otklonil zakonoproekt o ratifikatsii Soglasheniya o napravlenii kazakhstanskikh voennikh v Afganistan," *Kazinform*, June 9, 2011, <http://www.inform.kz/rus/article/2386428>, (accessed April 18, 2013); Roger McDermott, "Kazakhstan's Senate "Rejects" Planned Deployment to Afghanistan," *Eurasia Daily Monitor* 8, no. 119, June 21, 2011, [http://www.jamestown.org/single/?no\\_cache=1&tx\\_ttnews%5Btt\\_news%5D=38078](http://www.jamestown.org/single/?no_cache=1&tx_ttnews%5Btt_news%5D=38078), (accessed April 18, 2013).

<sup>17</sup> "Afghan talibs warn Kazakhstan," *Tengri News*, May 23, 2011, [http://en.tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\\_news/1942/](http://en.tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan_news/1942/), (accessed April 18, 2013).

<sup>18</sup> Zhannat Sisekenova and Albina Akhmetova, "Trevozhnoe Utro," *Liter*, May 18, 2011, [http://www.liter.kz/index.php?option=com\\_content&task=view&id=6035&Itemid=2](http://www.liter.kz/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=6035&Itemid=2), (accessed April 18, 2013); Maxim Popov, "VIDEO i FOTO: Vzryv pogremel primerno v 30 metrakh ot CIZO KNB v Astane," *Tengri News*, May 24, 2011, [http://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\\_news/188653/](http://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan_news/188653/), (accessed April 18, 2013).

---

<sup>19</sup> Botagoz Seydakhmetova, "Eta zaraznaya talibanofobiya," *Novoe Pokolenie*, May 26, 2011, <http://www.np.kz/index.php?newsid=8353>, (accessed April 22, 2013); Madina Aimbetova, "Veterany-afgantsy: Parlament vtyagivaet nas na voynu!," *Vremya*, May 26, 2011, <http://www.time.kz/index.php?module=news&newsid=21751>, (accessed April 18, 2013); Tamara Alina, "«Skol'ko segodnya ubil ty detei»," *Megapolis*, June 6, 2011, [http://megapolis.kz/art/Skolko\\_segodnya\\_ubil\\_ti\\_detey](http://megapolis.kz/art/Skolko_segodnya_ubil_ti_detey), (accessed April 18, 2013).

<sup>20</sup> Micheal J. McCarthy, Lt. Col USAF. *The Limits of Friendship: US Security Cooperation in Central Asia*. Maxwell Air Force Base, Alabama: Air University Press, 2007, [http://aupress.au.af.mil/digital/pdf/paper/wp\\_0009\\_mccarthy\\_limits\\_of\\_friendship.pdf](http://aupress.au.af.mil/digital/pdf/paper/wp_0009_mccarthy_limits_of_friendship.pdf), (accessed April 17, 2013); National Guard, "For the Media, Homeland Defense Fact Sheets, Global Engagement, State Partnership Program (SPP)," July 22, 2012, [http://www.nationalguard.mil/media/factsheets/NGB-PA\\_SPP\\_Fact\\_Sheet\\_22Jul12\\_.pdf](http://www.nationalguard.mil/media/factsheets/NGB-PA_SPP_Fact_Sheet_22Jul12_.pdf), (accessed April 18, 2013); Colonel John J. Jansen, "National Guard State Partnership Program: A Whole-of-Government Approach," *USAWC Strategy Research Project*, March 30, 2010, <http://www.dtic.mil/cgi-bin/GetTRDoc?Location=U2&doc=GetTRDoc.pdf&AD=ADA520003>, (accessed April 18, 2013); Arizona Department of Emergency and Military Affairs, "DEMA – Publications, DEMA Annual Reports," <http://www.azdema.gov/sa/publications/>, (accessed April 18, 2013); Ministerstvo Po Chrezvychnym Situatsiyam Respubliki Kazakhstan, "Deyatel'nost', Istoriya mnogostoronnego sotrudnichestvo," <http://old.emer.kz/activity/cooperation/3coop.php>, (accessed April 18, 2013); Douglas J. Gillert, "After Jumping, Battalion Learns to Crawl," *Armed Forces Press Service*, October 1, 1997, <http://www.defense.gov/news/newsarticle.aspx?id=41525> (accessed April 19, 2013);

<sup>21</sup> Jennifer D.P. Moroney, *Security Dynamics in the Former Soviet Bloc*, ed. Graeme P. Hurd and Jennifer D.P. Moroney (New York: Routledge Curzon, 2003), 175, [http://books.google.com/books/about/Security\\_Dynamics\\_in\\_the\\_Former\\_Soviet\\_B.html?id=kBQako-559EC](http://books.google.com/books/about/Security_Dynamics_in_the_Former_Soviet_B.html?id=kBQako-559EC), (accessed April 22, 2013); Vladimir Severniy, "Solo dlya desanta s orkestrom," *Ekspress-K*, August 4, 2002, <http://www.centrasia.ru/newsA.php?st=1028410020>, (accessed at Centrasia.ru, April 22, 2013); "Barsa-balans. Amerikanskomu spetsnazu ochen' ponravilos' trenirovat'sya v Kazakhstane," *Khabar*, August 7, 2002, <http://www.centrasia.ru/newsA.php?st=1028664240>, (accessed at Centrasia.ru, April 22, 2013); "U.S.-Kazakh Military Exercise Underway," *Monitor, Jamestown Foundation* 4, no. 109 (June 8, 1998), [http://www.jamestown.org/single/?no\\_cache=1&tx\\_ttnews%5Btt\\_news%5D=16512&tx\\_ttnews%5BbackPid%5D=212](http://www.jamestown.org/single/?no_cache=1&tx_ttnews%5Btt_news%5D=16512&tx_ttnews%5BbackPid%5D=212), (accessed April 22, 2013); Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan, "History of the Armed Forces, 1999," <http://mod.gov.kz/mod-en/index.php/2009-06-25-05-24-29/127-1999->, (accessed April 22, 2013), "History of the Armed Forces, 2002," <http://www.mod.gov.kz/mod-en/index.php/2009-06-25-05-24-29/130-2002->, (accessed April 22, 2013); "Joint US-Kazakh military exercises under way in southern Kazakhstan," *Interfax-Kazakhstan*, March 7, 2002; "Yo, sergeant," *Gazeta.kz*, March 12, 2002, <http://engnews.gazeta.kz/art.asp?aid=303092>, (accessed April 22, 2013).

<sup>22</sup> Master Sgt. Stephen Barrett, "Training Helps Cooperative Osprey Troops for Main Exercise," *Armed Forces Press Service*, August 28, 1996, <http://www.defense.gov/News/NewsArticle.aspx?ID=40725>, (accessed April 25, 2013); Defense Link, "Memorandum for Correspondents," May 22, 1998, [http://www.defense.gov/news/May1998/m05221998\\_m083-98.html](http://www.defense.gov/news/May1998/m05221998_m083-98.html), (accessed April 25, 2013); North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO), "International Military Staff, IMS Press Release," February 27, 2001, <http://www.nato.int/ims/2001/i010227e.htm>, (accessed April 25, 2013).

---

<sup>23</sup> McCarthy, "The Limits of Friendship: US Security Cooperation in Central Asia,"; Defense Link, "Memorandum for Correspondents," May 29, 1997, [http://www.defense.gov/news/May1997/m052997\\_m088-97.html](http://www.defense.gov/news/May1997/m052997_m088-97.html), (accessed April 22, 2013).

<sup>24</sup> Kent Waller, "Combined Endeavor '00," IA Newsletter, Volume 4, Number 1, [http://iac.dtic.mil/iatac/download/Vol4\\_No1.pdf](http://iac.dtic.mil/iatac/download/Vol4_No1.pdf), (accessed April 22, 2013); William Triplett, "Combined Endeavor 2001, Interoperability for Future Operations," *Echo, 5th Signal Command*, Summer/Fall 2001, [http://www.5sigcmd.army.mil/Publications/ECHO/ECHO\\_2001\\_FALL.pdf](http://www.5sigcmd.army.mil/Publications/ECHO/ECHO_2001_FALL.pdf), (accessed April 22, 2013); William Triplett, "Combined Endeavor 2002," *Echo, 5th Signal Command*, Summer 2002, [http://www.5sigcmd.army.mil/Publications/ECHO/ECHO\\_2002\\_SUMMER.pdf](http://www.5sigcmd.army.mil/Publications/ECHO/ECHO_2002_SUMMER.pdf), (accessed April 22, 2013); "Combined Endeavor – 03 In Full Swing," United States European Command, May 12, 2003, <http://www.eucom.mil/english/FullStory.asp?article=COMBINED-ENDEAVOR-03-IN-FULL-SWING>, (accessed April 22, 2013); "Combined Endeavor 2004 Underway in Germany and Bulgaria," United States European Command, May 6, 2004, <http://www.eucom.mil/english/FullStory.asp?article=Combined-Endeavor-2004-Underway-Germany-Bulgaria>, (accessed April 22, 2013); "Interoperability exercise Combined Endeavor 2009 has started," Partnership for Peace Information Management System (PIMS), September 4, 2009, <http://web.archive.org/web/20090923031606/http://www.pims.org/news/2009/09/04/interoperability-exercise-combined-endeavor-2009-has-started>, (accessed April 22, 2013); Denver Makle, "Combined Endeavor brings forces from 40 nations together to streamline communications," U.S. Army, News Archives, Article, September 9, 2010, [http://www.army.mil/article/44910/Combined\\_Endeavor\\_brings\\_forces\\_from\\_40\\_nations\\_together\\_to\\_streamline\\_communications/](http://www.army.mil/article/44910/Combined_Endeavor_brings_forces_from_40_nations_together_to_streamline_communications/), (accessed April 22, 2013).

<sup>25</sup> Asian Disaster Reduction Center (ADRC), "DRR Information of Member Countries, Kazakhstan, Country Report 1999 (English Version), [http://www.adrc.asia/countryreport/KAZ/KAZeng99/Kazakhstan99.htm#\\_Toc494266064](http://www.adrc.asia/countryreport/KAZ/KAZeng99/Kazakhstan99.htm#_Toc494266064), (accessed April 22, 2013); Ministry for emergency situations of the Republic of Kazakhstan, "Information, International Cooperation, International Cooperation, [http://eng.emer.kz/?option=com\\_content&view=category&layout=blog&id=2](http://eng.emer.kz/?option=com_content&view=category&layout=blog&id=2), (accessed April 22, 2013); United States Coast Guard Auxiliary, "Newsletter, Watercraft and Vessel Safety (WAVES), 2000, Issue 6, <http://bdept.cgaux.org/waves/wave200006.pdf>, (accessed April 25, 2013); "Arizona National Guard State Partnership Program with the Republic of Kazakhstan, [http://www.ng.mil/ia\\_backup/States/states/az\\_kazakhstan.htm](http://www.ng.mil/ia_backup/States/states/az_kazakhstan.htm), (accessed April 25, 2013).

<sup>26</sup> McCarthy, "The Limits of Friendship: US Security Cooperation in Central Asia,"; Ancient and Honorable Artillery Company of Massachusetts, "News/Events, News Archives, 2005-2006, Regional Cooperation 2006 – Task Force Patriot," <http://www.ahac.us.com/newsarchives/MinutemanWinter07Pg13-15.pdf>, (accessed April 22, 2013); "V Kyrgyzstane nachalis' desyatidnevnye ucheniya «Regional'noe sotrudnichestvo-2006»,» *Asia-Plus*, July 18, 2006, <http://news.tj/ru/news/v-kyrgyzstane-nachalis-desyatidnevnye-ucheniya-regionalnoe-sotrudnichestvo-2006>, (accessed April 22, 2013); "V Kyrgyzstane nachalis' voennye ucheniya «Regional'noe sotrudnichestvo-2006»,» *Gazeta.kz*, July 17, 2006, <http://news.gazeta.kz/art.asp?aid=206628>, (accessed April 22, 2013); Norwich University, "News and Events, 2007 News Archive, A Central-Asian education in diplomacy," November 2, 2007, <http://www.norwich.edu/about/news/2007/110207-kazakhstan.html>, (accessed April 22, 2013); "Tadzhikistan prinimaet uchastie v mezhdunarodnykh ucheniyakh «Regional'noe sotrudnichestvo-2007» v Astane," *Asia-Plus*, June 7, 2007, <http://news.tj/ru/news/tadzhikistan-prinimaet-uchastie-v-mezhdunarodnykh-ucheniakh-regionalnoe-sotrudnichestvo-2007-v>, (accessed April 22, 2013); "Na territorii Kyrgyzstana proidet mnogonatsional'noe komandno-shtabnoe uchenie «Regional'noe sotrudnichestvo-2008»,» *PR.kg*, July 19, 2008, <http://www.pr.kg/news/kg/2008/07/19/6115/>, (accessed April 22, 2013); "«Regional'noe sotrudnichestvo-2008» v

---

Kyrgyzstane,” *Top TJ*, July 19, 2008, [http://www.toptj.com/News/2008/07/19/regional\\_noe\\_sotrudnichestvo\\_2008\\_v\\_kyrgyzstane](http://www.toptj.com/News/2008/07/19/regional_noe_sotrudnichestvo_2008_v_kyrgyzstane), (accessed April 22, 2013); “Na territorii Kyrgyzstana proïdut ucheniya “Regional’noe sotrudnichestvo-2008”,” *Trend*, July 19, 2008, <http://www.trend.az/regions/casia/kyrgyzstan/1251276.html>, (accessed April 22, 2013); “Mnogonatsional’nye virtual’nye ucheniya «Regional’noe sotrudnichestvo-2009» startovali v Dushanbe,” *Asia-Plus*, August 6, 2009, <http://news.tj/ru/news/mnogonatsionalnye-virtualnye-ucheniya-regionalnoe-sotrudnichestvo-2009-startovali-v-dushanbe>, (accessed April 22, 2013); “V Dushanbe prokhodyat ucheniya «Regional’noe sotrudnichestvo-2009»,” *Khovar*, August 6, 2009, <http://khovar.tj/rus/archive/12661-v-dushanbe-prohodyat-ucheniya-regionalnoe-sotrudnichestvo-2009.html>, (accessed April 22, 2013); Maj. Ghazanfar Iqbal, “U.S., allies train for disasters,” United States Central Command, News, August 24, 2010, <http://www.centcom.mil/news/u-s-allies-train-for-disasters>, (accessed April 22, 2013); Avaz Yuldashev, “V Voennom institute Minoborony Tadzhiqistana prokhodyat ucheniya «Regional’noe sotrudnichestvo-2011»,” *Asia-Plus*, September 23, 2011, <http://www.news.tj/ru/news/v-voennom-institute-minoborony-tadzhikistana-prokhodyat-ucheniya-regionalnoe-sotrudnichestvo-2011>, (accessed April 22, 2013); “V Kyrgyzstane prokhodyat ucheniya «Regional’noe sotrudnichestvo-2012»,” *Top TJ*, June 26, 2012, [http://www.toptj.com/News/2012/06/26/v\\_kyrgyzstane\\_prokhodyat\\_ucheniya\\_regional\\_noe\\_sotrudnichestvo\\_2012](http://www.toptj.com/News/2012/06/26/v_kyrgyzstane_prokhodyat_ucheniya_regional_noe_sotrudnichestvo_2012), (accessed April 22, 2013); “V Kyrgyzstane zavershayutsya ucheniya «Regional’noe sotrudnichestvo-2012»,” *Fergana News*, June 27, 2012, <http://www.fergananews.com/news.php?id=18948>, (accessed April 22, 2013); “V Kyrgyzstane prokhodyat mnogonatsional’noe ucheniya «Regional’noe sotrudnichestvo-2012»,” *Kabar*, June 22, 2012, <http://kabar.kg/society/full/35661>, (accessed April 22, 2013).

<sup>27</sup> McCarthy, “*The Limits of Friendship: US Security Cooperation in Central Asia*,” “Kazakhstan Hosts Counterterrorism Exercise,” *RFE/RL*, Newsline, September 13, 2006, <http://www.rferl.org/content/article/1143715.html>, (accessed April 22, 2013); Erlik Erzhanuli, “Ulybritaniyalik zhauyngerler Almatydaghy manggilik alaughu gul shoqtaryn qoidy,” *Kazinform*, September 18, 2006, <http://www.inform.kz/kaz/article/1159730>, (accessed July 26, 2011); “Kazakhstan Hosts Multinational Military Exercise,” *RFE/RL*, Newsline, September 24, 2007, <http://www.rferl.org/content/article/1143959.html>, (accessed April 22, 2013); Roger McDermott, “Kazakhstan’s Defense Policy: An Assessment of the Trends,” *Strategic Studies Institute*, February 11, 2009, <http://www.strategicstudiesinstitute.army.mil/pubs/display.cfm?pubID=904>, (accessed April 22, 2013); “Kazakhstan, NATO hold peacekeeping exercises,” *RIANovosti*, September 15, 2008, <http://en.rian.ru/world/20080915/116797691.html>, (accessed April 22, 2013); “Khalyqaralyq taktikalyq-arnai bitimgherlik oqu-zhattyghuynyng zhabyly,” *Kazinform*, September 23, 2009, <http://www.inform.kz/kaz/article/2199800>, (accessed April 22, 2013); Vladimir Severnyy, “Efreytorskiy Zazor,” *Megapolis*, August 30, 2010, [http://megapolis.kz/art/Efreytorskiy\\_zazor](http://megapolis.kz/art/Efreytorskiy_zazor), (accessed April 22, 2013); Nadezhda Plyaskina, “«Stepnoy Oryol» klyuvom ne shchyokaet,” *Vremya*, August 17, 2010, <http://www.time.kz/index.php?module=news&newsid=17380>, (accessed April 22, 2013); Vladimir Severnyy, “Orlinaya okhota nachalas’ segodnya...,” *Megapolis*, August 8, 2011, [http://megapolis.kz/art/Orlinaya\\_ohota\\_nachalas\\_segodnya](http://megapolis.kz/art/Orlinaya_ohota_nachalas_segodnya), (accessed April 22, 2013); Nadezhda Plyaskina, “Stepnoy oryol – na vzlyote,” *Vremya*, August 10, 2011, <http://www.time.kz/index.php?module=news&newsid=23033>, (accessed April 22, 2013); “Mirotvorcheskie ucheniya «Stepnoï Oryol-2012» nachalis’ v Almatynskoi oblasti,” *Khabar*, September 6, 2012, [http://www.khabar.kz/rus/politics/Mirotvorcheskie\\_ucheniya\\_Stepnoj\\_orel-2012\\_nachalisj\\_v\\_Almatynskoi\\_oblasti.html](http://www.khabar.kz/rus/politics/Mirotvorcheskie_ucheniya_Stepnoj_orel-2012_nachalisj_v_Almatynskoi_oblasti.html), (accessed February 8, 2013); “Vzvod mobil’nykh voïsk Minoborony RT prinimaet uchastie v ucheniyakh “Stepnoï oryol”,” *Avesta*, September 5, 2012, <http://www.avesta.tj/security/13972-vzvod-mobilnyh-voysk-minoborony-rt-prinimaet-uchastie-v-ucheniayah>

---

[stepnoy-orel.html](#), (accessed April 22, 2013); Mira Mustafina, "Golos Mira," *Liter*, September 20, 2012, [http://www.liter.kz/index.php?option=com\\_content&task=view&id=11144](http://www.liter.kz/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=11144), (accessed April 22, 2013).

<sup>28</sup> "Ministr oborony Kazakhstana sovershil pervyi ofitsial'nyi vizit v Afganistan," *Tengri News*, April 10, 2013, [http://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\\_news/ministr-oboronyi-kazahstana-sovershil-perviy-ofitsialnyiy-vizit-v-afganistan-231871/](http://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan_news/ministr-oboronyi-kazahstana-sovershil-perviy-ofitsialnyiy-vizit-v-afganistan-231871/), (accessed April 30, 2013).

<sup>29</sup> North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO), "Euro-Atlantic Disaster Response Coordination Centre, EADRCC Exercises," <http://www.nato.int/eadrcc/exercises-e.htm>, (accessed April 22, 2013).

<sup>30</sup> Erin Zagursky, "USAFE Airmen kick off RESCUER/MEDCUER 2005," 435th Air Base Wing Public Affairs, September 12, 2005, <http://www.usafe.af.mil/news/story.asp?id=123017452>, (accessed April 22, 2013).

<sup>31</sup> Roger McDermott and Col. Igor Mukhamedov, "Kazakhstan's Peacekeeping Support in Iraq," *Central Asia Caucasus Institute Analyst*, January 28, 2004, <http://www.cacianalyst.org/?q=node/1809/print>, (accessed April 19, 2013); iCasualties.org, "Operation Iraqi Freedom, Iraq Coalition Casualties: Military Deaths by Country, Nationality: KAZ," 2009, <http://icasualties.org/Iraq/Nationality.aspx?hndQry=KAZ>, (accessed April 19, 2013).

<sup>32</sup> "Astana sygraet znachimuyu rol' v protsesse uregulirovaniya situatsii v Afganistane – Prezident IRA Khamid Karzai," *Kazinform*, June 14, 2012, <http://www.inform.kz/rus/article/2472034>, (accessed April 23, 2013).

<sup>33</sup> "Putin ozabochen vyvodom voisk soyuznikov iz Afganistana," *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, December 19, 2012, <http://www.ng.ru/news/422279.html>, (accessed April 23, 2013); Gulnara Zhandagulova, "V Moskve nachalos' zasedanie sessii ODKB s uchastiem glav gosudarstv," *Tengri News*, December 19, 2012, [http://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\\_news/v-moskve-nachalos-zasedanie-sessii-odkb-s-uchastiem-glav-gosudarstv-225408/](http://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan_news/v-moskve-nachalos-zasedanie-sessii-odkb-s-uchastiem-glav-gosudarstv-225408/), (accessed April 23, 2013); Wu Jiao, Zhou Wa, and Cui Haipei, "SCO will be 'fortress of security and stability'," *China Daily*, June 8, 2012, [http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/world/2012-06/08/content\\_15484205.htm](http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/world/2012-06/08/content_15484205.htm), (accessed April 23, 2013).

<sup>34</sup> Vladimir Mukhin, "Zontik dlya ODKB moderniziruyut v Kante," *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, April 17, 2013, [http://www.ng.ru/armies/2013-04-17/1\\_odkb.html](http://www.ng.ru/armies/2013-04-17/1_odkb.html), (accessed May 20, 2013).

<sup>35</sup> Vladimir Georgiev, "Korotko, Manevry na yuge SNG," *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, November 5, 1999, [http://nvo.ng.ru/wars/1999-11-05/1\\_korotko.html](http://nvo.ng.ru/wars/1999-11-05/1_korotko.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Vladimir Mukhin, "Voennye kontakty aktiviziruyutsya," *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, December 17, 1999, [http://nvo.ng.ru/notes/1999-12-17/8\\_contacts.html](http://nvo.ng.ru/notes/1999-12-17/8_contacts.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Vladimir Georgiev, "Voyska treniruyutsya," *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, April 4, 2000, [http://www.ng.ru/cis/2000-04-04/5\\_arm.html](http://www.ng.ru/cis/2000-04-04/5_arm.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Yuriy Mashin, "Preventivnyy udar vakhkhabistam, v Sredney Azii nachalis' voenniye ucheniya," *Kommersant*, March 30, 2000, <http://www.kommersant.ru/doc/144009>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Roman Streshnev, "Chuvstvo Loktya," *Krasnaya Zvezda*, April 11, 2001, [http://old.redstar.ru/2001/04/11\\_04/r\\_w31.html](http://old.redstar.ru/2001/04/11_04/r_w31.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Vladimir Georgiev, "Virtual'nye manevry v Moskve," *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, April 4, 2001, [http://www.ng.ru/cis/2001-04-04/5\\_virtual.html](http://www.ng.ru/cis/2001-04-04/5_virtual.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Roman Streshnev, "Shchit Sodruzhestva derzhit udar," *Krasnaya Zvezda*, June 18, 2002, [http://old.redstar.ru/2002/06/18\\_06/1\\_01.html](http://old.redstar.ru/2002/06/18_06/1_01.html), (accessed April 25, 2013); Kollektivnye sily bystrogo razvertyvaniya vperve razvernulis' stol' massovo," *Kazakhstanskaya Pravda*, June 18, 2002, <http://www.centrasia.ru/newsA.php?st=1024378200>, (accessed at Centrasia.ru, April 25, 2013).

---

<sup>36</sup> “CSTO Countries Launch Joint Exercise in Kirgystan, Kazakhstan,” *RIA Novosti*, August 2, 2004, <http://en.rian.ru/onlinenews/20040802/39766428.html>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Erica Marat, “CSTO’s Antiterrorist Exercises “Rubezh-2004” Score High Rating Among Member-States,” *Central Asia-Caucasus Institute Analyst*, August 25, 2004, <http://www.cacianalyst.org/resources/pdf/issues/20040825Analyst.pdf>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Roger McDermott, “Russia Plays Peace Advocate in Kyrgyz “Regime Change,” *Eurasia Daily Monitor* 2, no. 67 (April 5, 2005), [http://www.jamestown.org/programs/edm/single/?tx\\_ttnews%5Btt\\_news%5D=30212&tx\\_ttnews%5BbackPid%5D=176&no\\_cache=1](http://www.jamestown.org/programs/edm/single/?tx_ttnews%5Btt_news%5D=30212&tx_ttnews%5BbackPid%5D=176&no_cache=1), (accessed April 26, 2013); “Counter-Terrorist Exercise “Rubezh-2005” to End in Tajikistan Soon,” *RIA Novosti*, April 6, 2005, <http://en.rian.ru/onlinenews/20050406/39697501.html>, (accessed April 26, 2013); “The Rubezh-2006 military exercise,” *RIA Novosti*, September 2, 2006, <http://en.rian.ru/photolents/20060902/53430993.html>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Roman Streshnev and Aleksandr Tikhonov, “Pod solntsem goryachim...,” *Krasnaya Zvezda*, August 24, 2006, [http://old.redstar.ru/2011/08/17\\_08/1\\_04.html](http://old.redstar.ru/2011/08/17_08/1_04.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Aleksandr Pinchuk, “K novomu «Rubezhu»,” *Krasnaya Zvezda*, July 28, 2006, [http://old.redstar.ru/2006/07/28\\_07/3\\_01.html](http://old.redstar.ru/2006/07/28_07/3_01.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); “V Tadzhikestane nachinaetsya vtoroy etap ucheniy ODKB «Rubezh-2007»,” *RIA Novosti*, April 3, 2007, <http://ria.ru/society/20070403/62980442.html>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Sergei Permyakov, “Kontrataka s «Rubezha-2007»,” *Voенno-Promyshlenny Kur’er*, April 4, 2007, <http://vpk-news.ru/articles/3525>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Mikhaylov, “Rubezh protiv terror,”; “Ucheniya «Rubezh-2010» uspeshno zaversheny v Tadzhikestane – Minoborony RF,” *RIA Novosti*, April 26, 2010, [http://ria.ru/defense\\_safety/20100426/226879961.html](http://ria.ru/defense_safety/20100426/226879961.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Oleg Gorupay, “«Rubezh» zadachu reshil,” *Krasnaya Zvezda*, April 27, 2010, [http://old.redstar.ru/2010/04/27\\_04/1\\_02.html](http://old.redstar.ru/2010/04/27_04/1_02.html), (accessed April 26, 2013).

<sup>37</sup> Vladimir Mukhin, “Kavkazskiy opyt dlya voysk Urala,” *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, September 2, 2008, [http://www.ng.ru/regions/2008-09-02/7\\_ural.html](http://www.ng.ru/regions/2008-09-02/7_ural.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); “Trenirovka voennykh RF i Kazakhstana proydet na «Chebarkule»,” *RIA Novosti*, September 2, 2008, [http://ria.ru/defense\\_safety/20080902/150868634.html](http://ria.ru/defense_safety/20080902/150868634.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Oksana Parpura, “V Kazakhstane v uchebnom tsentre «Oymasha» startovalo sovmetnoe strategicheskoe uchenie «Tsentr-2011»,” *Kazakhstanskaya Pravda*, September 19, 2011, <http://kazpravda.kz/c/1316430921>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Vladimir Severnyy, “Kaspiyskaya armada,” *Megapolis*, September 19, 2011, [http://megapolis.kz/art/Kaspiyskaya\\_armada](http://megapolis.kz/art/Kaspiyskaya_armada), (accessed April 26, 2013); “Kyrgyzstan: Pod Bishkekком sily KSOR unichtozhat gruppu boevikov,” *Fergana.ru*, September 19, 2011, <http://www.fergananews.com/news.php?id=17310>, (accessed April 26, 2013); “Ucheniya s boevoy strel’boy «Tsentr-2011» zavershilis’ v Tadzhikestane,” *RIA Novosti*, September 22, 2011, [http://ria.ru/defense\\_safety/20110922/441783339.html](http://ria.ru/defense_safety/20110922/441783339.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); “Na ucheniyakh «Tsentr-2011» koalitsiya otrazhaet raketnyy udar «protivnika»,” *RIA Novosti*, [http://ria.ru/defense\\_safety/20110922/441611442.html](http://ria.ru/defense_safety/20110922/441611442.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Aleksandr Kharmchikhin, “«Tsentr» priblizilsya k okrainam,” *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, October 7, 2011, [http://nvo.ng.ru/maneuvers/2011-10-07/1\\_center.html](http://nvo.ng.ru/maneuvers/2011-10-07/1_center.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); “Motostrelki TSVO pribyli v Kazakhstan dlya uchastiya v ucheniyakh «Tsentr-2011»,” *RIA Novosti*, September 21, 2011, [http://ria.ru/defense\\_safety/20110921/441024984.html](http://ria.ru/defense_safety/20110921/441024984.html), (accessed April 26, 2013).

<sup>38</sup> “Kazakhstan: Prezidenty Uzbekistana i Belarusi proignorirovali voennye ucheniya ODKB,” *Fergana.ru*, October 16, 2009, <http://www.fergananews.com/news.php?id=13221>, (accessed September 21, 2011); “Foto Nedeli: “Vzaimodeystvie-2009”: perviy blin komom,” *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, October 19, 2009, [http://www.ng.ru/week/2009-10-19/8\\_photo.html](http://www.ng.ru/week/2009-10-19/8_photo.html), (accessed September 21, 2011); “Leaders of ex-Soviet states

---

inspect Central Asian military drills,” *RIA Novosti*, October 16, 2009, <http://en.rian.ru/exsoviet/20091016/156490733.html>, (accessed September 21, 2011).

<sup>39</sup> “CSTO exercise Cobalt 2010 begins in Rostov Oblast,” *Belarusian Telegraphy Agency*, June 7, 2010, <http://news.belta.by/en/news/politics?id=541754>, (accessed September 14, 2011).

<sup>40</sup> Aleksandr Aleksandrov, “Proverka mirotvorcheskogo bratstvo,” *Krasnaya Zvezda*, October 8, 2012, <http://www.redstar.ru/index.php/newspaper/item/5083-proverka-mirotvorcheskogo-bratstva>, (accessed April 26, 2013); “V Kazakhstane zavershilas’ aktivnaya faza pervogo mirotvorcheskogo ucheniya ODKB «Nerushimoe bratstvo-2012»,” *Asia-Plus*, October 18, 2012, <http://news.tj/ru/news/v-kazakhstane-zavershilas-aktivnaya-faza-pervogo-mirotvorcheskogo-ucheniya-odkb-nerushimoe-brat>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Aleksandr Aleksandrov, “Mirotvorcheskiĭ proryv,” *Krasnaya Zvezda*, October 18, 2012, <http://www.redstar.ru/index.php/newspaper/item/5325-mirotvorcheskiy-proryiv>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Vladimir Severniy, “Nerushimoe bratstvo-2012,” *Megapolis*, October 22, 2012, [http://megapolis.kz/art/Nerushimoe\\_bratstvo2012](http://megapolis.kz/art/Nerushimoe_bratstvo2012), (accessed April 26, 2013).

<sup>41</sup> HRIC, “Counter-Terrorism and Human Rights, Appendix E.1,”

<sup>42</sup> Liang Yongli and Du Xianzhou, “Coalition-2003: a successful joint anti-terrorism maneuver,” *PLA Daily*, August 14, 2003, <http://english.chinamil.com.cn/special/5army/txt/61.htm>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Human Rights in China (HRIC), “Counter-Terrorism and Human Rights: The Impact of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization, A Human Rights in China Whitepaper, March 2011, Appendix E.1: Military and Law Enforcement Cooperation between Member States of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization,” <http://www.hrichina.org/content/5239>, (accessed April 26, 2013).

<sup>43</sup> HRIC, “Counter-Terrorism and Human Rights, Appendix E.1,”; Tom Parfitt, “Russia and China rattle sabres with joint war games,” *The Guardian*, August 19, 2005, <http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2005/aug/19/russia.china>, (accessed April 26, 2013); “Russia’s Strategic Bombers to Carry Non-Nuclear Cruise Missiles in Joint Exercise with China,” *RIA Novosti*, August 23, 2005, <http://en.rian.ru/russia/20050823/41212931.html>, (accessed April 26, 2013); “Russia, China Hold Peace Mission 2009 Joint Exercise,” *RIA Novosti*, July 24, 2009, <http://en.rian.ru/photolents/20090724/155604547.html>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Li Xiaokun and Peng Kuang, “Mission for Peace Targets Terrorists,” *China Daily*, July 23, 2009, [http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/china/2009-07/23/content\\_8461128.htm](http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/china/2009-07/23/content_8461128.htm), (accessed April 26, 2013); “Some 3,000 troops deployed for Russian-Chinese anti-terror drills,” *RIA Novosti*, July 14, 2009, <http://en.rian.ru/world/20090714/155524827.html>, (accessed April 26, 2013); Ding Ying, “Practicing for Peace,” *Beijing Review*, September 23, 2010; “Peace Mission 2010 concludes, opens new page for SCO cooperation,” *Xinhua*, September 25, 2010, [http://news.xinhuanet.com/english2010/world/2010-09/25/c\\_13529321.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/english2010/world/2010-09/25/c_13529321.htm), (accessed April 26, 2013); “SCO to begin large-scale anti-terror drills in Kazakhstan,” *Kazinform*, September 9, 2010, <http://www.inform.kz/eng/article/2301848>, (accessed April 26, 2013); “Ucheniya SHOS «Mirnaya missiya» v Tadjikistane otkroyutsya v subbotu,” *RIA Novosti*, June 9, 2012, [http://ria.ru/defense\\_safety/20120609/669004273.html](http://ria.ru/defense_safety/20120609/669004273.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); “«Mirnaya missiya» ukrepila vzaimodeystvie stran SHOS, schtaet Minoborony,” *RIA Novosti*, June 14, 2012, [http://ria.ru/defense\\_safety/20120614/672977763.html](http://ria.ru/defense_safety/20120614/672977763.html), (accessed April 26, 2013); Aleksandr Tikhonov, “Ikh podruzhil Chorukh-Dayron,” *Krasnaya Zvezda*, June 14, 2012, <http://www.redstar.ru/index.php/newspaper/item/2800-ih-podruzhil-choruh-dayron>, (accessed April 26, 2013); “Bulgakov: «Mirnaya missiya-2012» ukrepila vzaimodeystvie SHOS v bor’be s terrorizmom,” *Asia-Plus*, June 14,

---

2012, <http://news.tj/ru/news/bulgakov-mirnaya-missiya-2012-ukrepila-vzaimodeistvie-shos-v-borbe-s-terrorizmom>, (accessed April 26, 2013).

<sup>44</sup> HRIC, "Counter-Terrorism and Human Rights, Appendix E.1,"; "China, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan complete anti-terror drills," *RIA Novosti*, May 7, 2011, <http://en.rian.ru/world/20110507/163915369.html>, (accessed April 29, 2013); "SCO joint anti-terror drill conducted in China's Xinjiang," *Xinhua*, May 7, 2011, [http://news.xinhuanet.com/english2010/photo/2011-05/07/c\\_13862967.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/english2010/photo/2011-05/07/c_13862967.htm), (accessed April 29, 2013).

<sup>45</sup> HRIC, "Counter-Terrorism and Human Rights, Appendix E.1,"; Central Asia-Caucasus Institute Silk Road Studies Program, "CEF Weekly Newsletter, 1. Shanghai Cooperation Organization, RATS held anti-terrorism exercise in Uzbekistan, No. 11, March 6-12, 2006, [http://www.silkroadstudies.org/new/docs/CEF/Weekly/March\\_6-12\\_2006.pdf](http://www.silkroadstudies.org/new/docs/CEF/Weekly/March_6-12_2006.pdf), (accessed April 29, 2013).

<sup>46</sup> Oleg Sidirov, "«Issyk-Kul' - Antiterror 2007» - uravnenie s tremya neizvestnymi," *Gazeta.kz*, June 5, 2007, <http://articles.gazeta.kz/art.asp?aid=92028> (part 1), June 8, 2007 <http://articles.gazeta.kz/art.asp?aid=92200> (part 2), (accessed April 26, 2013); Roger McDermott, "Kyrgyzstan Hosts SCO Anti-terrorist Exercises," *Eurasia Daily Monitor* 4, no. 109 (June 5, 2007), [http://www.jamestown.org/single/?no\\_cache=1&tx\\_ttnews%5Btt\\_news%5D=32786](http://www.jamestown.org/single/?no_cache=1&tx_ttnews%5Btt_news%5D=32786), (accessed April 26, 2013); "V Kirgizii proydetsya aktivnaya faza antiterroristicheskikh ucheniy SHOS," *RIA Novosti*, May 30, 2007, <http://ria.ru/politics/20070530/66302224.html>, (accessed April 26, 2013).

<sup>47</sup> HRIC, "Counter-Terrorism and Human Rights, Appendix E.1,"; Russian FSB warns of terrorist threat in Russia, Abkhazia, and South Ossetia," *Regnum*, September 5, 2008, <http://www.regnum.ru/english/1050844.html?forprint>, (accessed April 29, 2013); Lukoil Oil Company, "Press Centre, Photo, Command and staff exercises, International anti-terrorism exercises at Volgograd Refinery," [http://www.lukoil.com/back/gallery\\_image\\_list\\_6\\_5did\\_294\\_.html](http://www.lukoil.com/back/gallery_image_list_6_5did_294_.html), (accessed April 29, 2013).

<sup>48</sup> HRIC, "Counter-Terrorism and Human Rights, Appendix E.1,"

<sup>49</sup> Collective Security Treaty Organization, "Basic Facts," [http://www.odkb.gov.ru/start/index\\_aengl.htm](http://www.odkb.gov.ru/start/index_aengl.htm) (accessed April 24, 2013); The Shanghai Cooperation Organisation, "Brief introduction to the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation," <http://www.sectSCO.org/EN123/brief.asp>, (accessed April 24, 2013).

<sup>50</sup> Organizatsiya Dogovora o kollektivnoy bezopasnosti, "Dokumenty, Dogovor kollektivnoy bezopasnosti," [http://www.odkb.gov.ru/start/index\\_aengl.htm](http://www.odkb.gov.ru/start/index_aengl.htm), (accessed April 24, 2013); Roger McDermott, "CSTO Move Into The Information Age," *RFE/RL*, September 4, 2011, [http://www.rferl.org/content/commentary\\_csto\\_moves\\_into\\_information\\_age/24317363.html](http://www.rferl.org/content/commentary_csto_moves_into_information_age/24317363.html), (accessed April 23, 2013).

<sup>51</sup> Ibid.

<sup>52</sup> "Otppravka mirotvorets ODKB v Afganistan posle 2014 goda isklyuchena," *RIA Novosti*, October 9, 2012, <http://ria.ru/world/20121009/769941736.html>, (accessed April 24, 2013).

<sup>53</sup> The Shanghai Cooperation Organization, "Documents, 2002, Charter of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization," <http://www.sectSCO.org/EN123/show.asp?id=69>, (accessed April 29, 2013).

- 
- <sup>54</sup> “Russia hails SCO-Afghanistan cooperation deal,” *Xinhua*, November 9, 2011, [http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2005-11/09/content\\_3757564.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2005-11/09/content_3757564.htm), (accessed April 29, 2013); “China, Afghanistan upgrade ties to strategic partnership,” *Xinhua*, June 8, 2012, [http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/china/2012-06/08/c\\_131640214.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/china/2012-06/08/c_131640214.htm), (accessed April 29, 2013).
- <sup>55</sup> The Shanghai Cooperation Organization, “Documents, 2009, Plan of Action of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization Member States and the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan on combating terrorism, illicit drug trafficking and organized crime,” <http://www.sectSCO.org/EN123/show.asp?id=99>, (accessed April 29, 2013); Richard Weitz, “Uzbekistan: A Peek Inside an SCO Anti-Terrorism Center,” *Eurasianet*, September 25, 2012, <http://www.eurasianet.org/node/65960>, (accessed April 29, 2013).
- <sup>56</sup> “Glava FSKN odobril ideyu vernut’ rossiiskikh pogranichnikov v Tadzhiqistan,” *RIA Novosti*, May 5, 2011, <http://ria.ru/antidrugs/20110505/371118860.html>, (accessed May 21, 2013); Vladimir Mukhin, “Plan “Pyandzh” dlya rossiiskikh Pogranvoisk,” *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*, May 20, 2013, [http://www.ng.ru/armies/2013-05-20/1\\_piandj.html](http://www.ng.ru/armies/2013-05-20/1_piandj.html), (accessed May 21, 2013).
- <sup>57</sup> Andres Serrano Smith, “CIS peacekeeping in Tajikistan.” In *Regional peacekeepers: The paradox of Russian peacekeeping*, edited by John Mackinlay and Peter Cross, 156-183. Tokyo, Japan: United Nations University Press, 2003; Lena Johnson, *Tajikistan in the New Central Asia* (New York: I.B. Tauris and Co., 2006), 55-92.
- <sup>58</sup> “V Dushanbe obsudyat problemy narkooborota posle vyvoda sil ISAF iz Afganistana,” *Asia-Plus*, April 23, 2013, <http://news.tj/ru/news/v-dushanbe-obsudyat-problemy-narkooborota-posle-vyvoda-sil-isaf-iz-afganista>, (accessed April 23, 2013); “V Ashkhabade proshlo mezhdunarodnaya vstrecha po sodeistviyu Afganistanu,” *Turkmenistan.ru*, January 25, 2013, <http://www.turkmenistan.ru/ru/articles/38235.html>, (accessed April 23, 2013); Temir Isayev, “Islam Karimov ozvuchil strategiyu razvitiya armii Uzbekistana na blizhaishie gody,” *Podrobno*, January 13, 2012, <http://podrobno.uz/cat/politic/razvitie-armiya-Uzbekistana/>, (accessed April 23, 2013).
- <sup>59</sup> “Prezident Kazakhstana N. Nazarbayev ne soglasen s teoriyami o katastroficheskom razvitii sobytiiv Tsentral’noi Azii,” *Kazinform*, April 25, 2013, <http://www.inform.kz/rus/article/2553492>, (accessed April 25, 2013).
- <sup>60</sup> Serik Baydaulatov, “Minoborony afganskoï ugrozy ne vidit,” *Respublika*, May 8, 2013, <http://www.respublika-kz.info/news/politics/30237/>, (accessed May 17, 2013).
- <sup>61</sup> Ghanizada, “President Karzai To Attend 10th SCO Summit in Kazakhstan,” *Khaama Press*, June 14, 2012, <http://www.khaama.com/president-karzai-to-attend-10th-sco-summit-in-kazakhstan>, (accessed May 1, 2013); Yuri Arsalanov, “Trafik Mira,” *Liter*, April 27, 2013, [http://www.liter.kz/index.php?option=com\\_content&task=view&id=13333&Itemid=2](http://www.liter.kz/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=13333&Itemid=2), (accessed May 1, 2013).
- <sup>62</sup> Khushnood Nabizada, “Senior Afghan Officials Killed in Northern Afghan Province,” *Khaama Press*, May 28, 2011, <http://www.khaama.com/senior-afghan-officials-killed-in-takhar>, (accessed November 26, 2012); Ghanizada, “Head of Afghan Peace Council Assassinated,” *Khaama Press*, September 20, 2011, <http://www.khaama.com/head-of-afghan-peace-council-assassinated>, (accessed November 26, 2012); “Suicide Bomber Kills Local Afghan Leaders at Wedding,” *TOLONews*, July 14, 2012, <http://www.tolonews.com/en/afghanistan/6860-suicide-bomber-kills-local-afghan-leaders-at-wedding->, (accessed November 29, 2012).

---

<sup>63</sup> “Afghanistan’s legacy of assassinations,” *Al Jazeera*, December 15, 2012, <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/middleeast/2011/07/2011712114155648918.html>, (accessed May 2, 2013).

<sup>64</sup> “New Afghan Coalition Founded,” *Tolo News*, November 12, 2011, <http://tolonews.com/en/afghanistan/4390-new-afghan-coalition-founded>, (accessed May 2, 2013); National Democratic Institute, “Political Parties in Afghanistan,” June 2011, <http://www.ndi.org/files/Afghanistan-political-parties-july-2011.pdf>, (accessed May 2, 2013); as of May 2, 2013 the coalition’s website was no longer available, but a version of it can be seen at: <http://web.archive.org/web/20121005115659/http://www.jabhemelli.com/>, (accessed May 2, 2013); see also: <https://twitter.com/FazilRafi/status/301375448200384512/photo/1>, (accessed May 2, 2013).

<sup>65</sup> Dubovitsky, “Afganistan: kto vydaet litsenzii na ostrel,”

<sup>66</sup> Dubovitsky, “«Nesokrushimaya svobode» mozhnet prinesti afgantsam grazhdantskuyu voïnu,”